Dennis Building Development **Design Rationale Report** 25 February 2020





We are Fathom Studio.

For more than 20 years, major clients throughout the Atlantic provinces, across Canada, and abroad have commissioned Fathom to solve complex problems while providing world-class service.

Our firm offers non-traditional solutions and creativity to every problem—the results of deep collaboration between disciplines and approaches. Owned by principal Rob LeBlanc, our studio unites communication designers, web and new media specialists, exhibit designers, interior designers, writers, and 3D animation experts, along with architects, landscape architects, urban planners, and civil engineers to give strategic guidance, create engaging concepts, sell your ideas, engage with the public, and detail designs into a buildable package.

Fathom collaborates at all scales from sign designs and museum exhibits, to large residential buildings, up to comprehensive master plans for university campuses and downtowns.

fathom

Prepared for

Dexel Developments 1245 Barrington Street Halifax NS B3J 1Y2 902-446-9916 dexel.ca

Prepared by

Fathom Studio 1 Starr Lane Dartmouth, Nova Scotia 902 461 2525 fathomstudio.ca

Table of contents



03

Appendix

Appendix A: Pre-pre-application HRM comments 26

23





1.1 Project Brief

Fathom Studio, on behalf of Dexel Developments, is submitting a Site-Plan Approval Application for a mixed-use development at 1724, 1730, and 1740 Granville St (three lots in total: PIDS 00002626; 40594764; and 00002642). The project site is a corner street location, bounded by George Street to the North, Barrington Street to the West and Granville St to the East. The Proposed development includes two Heritage Properties. The Dennis building at the corner of George and Granville, and the Acadian Recorder building at the South East Corner of the site. The project also borders One Government Place on Granville and the first heritage building of the Crowe block at 1729 Barrington Street.

The properties (PIDS 00002626, 40594764, and 00002642) occupy 1,878m2 total. The existing properties do contain registered heritage buildings, abut registered heritage properties, and exist within a heritage conservation district.

The proposed development ranges from 8-storeys high on the Barrington Street Side to 9-storeys high along Granville Street, and navigates a substantial grade change of +3m along George Street . The building will include 120 units total (a mix of 1 and 2 bedroom units), over 650m2 of at grade retail space, and include 3 levels of concealed underground parking for a total of 110 parking stalls. Roof top amenity terraces provide a total of 100m2 common landscaped area.

This Project will include 2 Downtown Precincts with the property facing Barrington split between 2 precincts. Downtown Precinct 5 (Barrington Street Heritage Conservation) the other half of the property falls within Precinct 4 (Lower Downtown).

1.2 Design Summary

The design process for this project commenced with a research phase including current and past uses, the architectural history of buildings currently on site, and those lost. After extensive research it was clear that a new contemporary architecture is critical to infill this missing piece of our urban fabric.

Our design approach for this project is rooted in the conservation of heritage elements left on the site, which means that new work is physically and visually compatible with yet subordinate and distinguishable from the heritage elements. Our overall approach to the massing of the site is to create new human scale articulated street-scapes that pay homage to the fabric that was lost on this site while reflecting the contemporary time of their creations. This human scale articulation is balanced with manufactured masonry units at a handheld block scale that is subordinate and distinguishable from the heritage facades with larger glazing units and anodized metal cladding. The material pallet tonality and consistency also remain distinct and subordinate to the heritage facades. Critical to this new street-scape is the history around the Atlantic Trust building. When the Atlantic Trust building was built in 1912, it was considered the tallest and most modern building in the Maritimes. Our request for additional height at the corner of Barrington and George is to reintroduce a feature modern building to this corner. This acts as a contemporary homage to the past, and a new key architectural feature on this prominent corner. The additional height also allows for some transition to the vastly higher street wall and scale presented by the TD Building.

Above our street wall height we have added additional street-wall step-back requirements to maintain characterdefining elements of the Dennis Building and the Acadian Recorder Building. Each of these two buildings have cornice and parapet returns that were critical to maintain and present as visible elements to these buildings.

The additional setback for the mid-rise portion of the building further reinforces the importance of the heritage buildings with a subordinate and contemporary design. The massing of this mid-rise portion of the project remains



Fig. 1 1915 Barrington Street, looking north VIEW-5490, Wm. Notman & Son. Notman photographic Archives - McCord Museum.

Λ



consistent yet articulated with regular deep set metal cladding. This mid-rise massing is presented as a rational, yet articulated back drop to the series of new and existing heritage street-scapes.

It is critical for the new development to be presented as a singular mass or block. Introducing the look of multiple buildings above the street-wall at this scale of massing would appear if we are trying to create fake versions of a series heritage buildings. This would go directly against the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. Instead, a single mass with a regular grid of vertically proportioned windows clad in high quality plated metal pay homage to heritage through regularity and proportion. This persistent facade is visually compatible due to its vertical proportions and high quality materials, yet subordinate, due to the large amount of glazing, and its regularity and distinction from the heritage buildings.

5

1.3 Existing Planning and Land-use Context



Figure 1.0: Site Context - Existing



- Civic Addresses: 1724,1730, and 1740 Granville St PIDS 00002626, 40594764, and 00002642
- RMPS Designation: Regional Centre
- Plan Area: Halifax Peninsula
- Plan Sub-Area: Downtown Halifax Secondary Municipal Plan Area
- Zoning: Downtown Halifax 1 (DH-1) (LUB Map 1)
- Precinct: Precinct 4 Lower Downtown(PID 00002626 and 00002642) and Precinct 5 Barrington Street Heritage Conservation (1/2 of PID 40594764) (but not part of Schedule W)(LUB Maps 1 and 2)
- Max. Pre-Bonus Heights: 22m (PID 00002626 and 00002642) and 28m on 1/2 of (PID 40594764) (LUB Map 4)
- Max. Post-Bonus Heights: 28m (PID 40594764, 00002626 and 00002642) (LUB Map 5)

1.4 Land-use By-law Summary

Per the full submission package and below summary, the proposed building satisfies all LUB requirements with the exception of the noted variances. Refer to individual variance requests for additional details.

Built Form Requirements

- 8(2) Number of buildings: compliant; Development Will be considered one building.
- 8(3-5) Heritage: compliant; Refer to Heritage Impact and design package.
- 8(7) Building Height:
 see variance request #3
 28m Precinct 4-5 maximum height;

Overall building height adjusted to match Heritage building fenestration and floor to floor (no post-bonus height allowed for Precinct 4)

- 8(8) Service Elements: compliant; service elements exceeding maximum building height requirements occupy less than 30% of the roof area
- 8(9) Visual Terminus: not within a prominent visual terminus site (Map 9)
- 8(10) Service Elements: Compliant

8(13) 4.5m FTF Height:
 see variance request #4;

floor to floor height at retail space; to maintain Dennis building Floor to floor heights. We have counter balanced this variance with a double high retail space at the corner of Barrington and George.

- 8(14) View Planes: compliant; Built form under both VP-4 and 5
- 8(17) Ramparts: compliant; no part visible from ramparts
- 8(18) Wind Impact: compliant; Refer to Wind Study
- 8(19) Accessory Buildings: compliant; no accessory buildings
- 8(20) Materials: compliant; no prohibited cladding

Streetwalls

- 9(2,3) Streetwall Height:
 see variance request #1;
 15.5m maximum streetwall height (Barrington);
- 11m minimum streetwall height (Barrington);
- 18.5m maximum streetwall height (George and Granville);
- 9(6) Streetwall Width:

see variance request #2;

Variations to preserve heritage defining elements of existing Heritage buildings.

9(7) Stepbacks:
 0-3m (LUB Map 6) zone;
 Compliant

Building Setbacks and Stepbacks

 10(4) Mid-Rise: compliant; Notwithstanding subsection (4), no setback is required from an interior lot line for the mid-rise portion of any building on Central Blocks as identified on Map 8.

Precincts: Additional Requirements

11(7) Precinct 5
 HRM By-law H-500 compliant; not part of Schedule W (LUB Map 1)

Bonus Height Provisions

12(7) Public Benefits:
 (a) Where the development includes a registered heritage property that is to be maintained
 (f) provision of public art
 (j) under-grounding of services

Parking

- 14(1) Surface Parking: compliant; no surface parking
- 14(15) Bicycle Parking: compliant;
 0.5 spaces required per dwelling unit, 80% Class A, 20% Class B 120 units total = 60 total; 48 Class A and 12 Class B required 1 space per 300m2 general retail, 20% Class A, 80% Class B, with min 2x Class B 650m2 general retail; 2 Class B required, 1 Class A 49 Class A provided within underground parkade 14 Class B provided 30m from entry

02 Site Plan Variance Requests

2.0

Variance Summary



Variance One: Streetwall Height

- Building massing with requested streetwall height variance.
- i. Consistency with Downtown Halifax Schedule S-1 Design Manual
- ii. Transitional Block
- iii. Build Heritage & Urban Character



Variance Two: Streetwall Width

- Granville street perspective rendering.
- Historic details and returns are retained and articulated.
- Granville street elevation indicating width of streetwall reveals to highlight historic facade elements.

Variance Three: Maximum Height

- Rendering of Barrington and George
 Street corner
- Diagram showing floor levels of Dennis Building relative to new construction
- George Street elevation indicating the floor heights in addition are set be Dennis building existing floors
- Building cross-section showing integration of floor heights



Variance Four: Land Uses at Grade

- Rendering at George Street and Granville Street
- Rendering of Granville Street
- Diagram of Granville Street showing streetwall ground floor height
- Diagram of Barrington and George Street corner showing streetwall ground floor height

10

2.1 Variance One: Streetwall Height

Design Rationale

Based on the historic context of the site and the provisions of Schedule S-1 Design Manual, we are requesting a streetwall height variance for part of the proposed building on the corner of Barrington and George St. We are also requesting a reduced street-wall for a portion of Barrington Street so we can address adjacent existing heritage street wall heights.

The variance request is based on the following three rationales;

- i. Consistency with Downtown Halifax Schedule S-1 Design Manual
- ii. Transitional Block
- iii. Built Heritage / Urban Character

Relevant literature is as follows:

Downtown Halifax Land-Use Bylaw Section

9(2) as shown on Map 7; Barrington St: 11m min 15.5m max George and Granville St: 18.5m 9(8) for variance through S.P.A.

Schedule S-1 Design Manual

3.2.1 Design of the Streetwall3.2.5 Sloping Conditions3.4.1 Prominent Civic Frontage3.4.2 Corner Sites3.6.3 Streetwall Height Variance

i. Consistency with Downtown Halifax Schedule S-1 Design Manual

The open space across Barrington Street created by Grand Parade provides the site with a significant amount of open space, a comfortable pedestrian experience is maintained as no narrow street enclosure is created by facing buildings and streetwalls. Furthermore, the Design Manual advocates creating strong edges to major public open spaces, such as Cornwallis Park. Perhaps the most significant public open space in the downtown core, Grand Parade meets this definition. As such, we believe that the streetwall height variance is consistent with the intent of the Design Manual.

According to the S-1 Design Manual Section 3.6.3, Streetwall heights may be varied by Site Plan Approval where:

- a. The streetwall height is consistent with the objectives and guidelines of the Design Manual; and
- b. The modification is for a corner element that is used to join streetwalls of differing heights.

To ensure a comfortable human-scaled street enclosure, streetwall height should generally be no less than 11 metres and generally no greater than a height proportional (1:1) to the width of the street as measured from building face to building face. Accordingly, maximum streetwall heights are defined and correspond to the varying widths of downtown streets generally 15.5m, 17m or 18.5m. Consistent with the principle of creating strong edges to major public open spaces, a streetwall height of 21.5m is permitted around the perimeter of Cornwallis Park. Maximum Streetwall Heights are shown on Map 7 of the Land Use By-law.





The Schedule S-1 Design Manual makes reference to Corner Sites (Section 3.4.2). Our response to each specific item is in the following, highlighted in blue:

Corner buildings have a greater visual prominence given that they terminate two streetwalls and that they have excellent visual exposure from the open space created by street intersections. This special condition should be acknowledged with design responses such as:

a. Provision of a change in the building massing at the corner, in relation to the streetwall.

New, taller streetwall height to reinforce the corner.

b. Provision of distinctive architectural treatments such as spires, turrets, belvederes, porticos, arcades, or archways.

New double height fenestration of upper 2 storeys, a modern interpretation of upper level archways. Fig 2.1

c. Developments on all corner sites must provide a frontal design to both street frontages.

New architectural features that face both Barrington and George Streets: a feature glass double-height retail space with interpretive and landscape elements to mitigate the grade change (sloping to the harbour).

d. Alternatively, buildings may be sited to define the edge of an on-site public open space, for example, plazas, promenades, or eroded building corners resulting in the creation of public space.

While no public space is located on this site, the corner is present within a visual right away of +70m and therefore warrants a large scale address. The S-1 Design Manual makes reference to Pedestrian Streetscapes and Design of the Streetwall (Section 3.2.1). Our response to each specific item is in the following, highlighted in blue:

Design of the Streetwall In designing streetwalls, the following guidelines should be observed:

c. Generally, streetwall heights should be proportional to the width of the right of way, a 1:1 ratio between streetwall height and right of way width. Above the maximum streetwall height, further building heights are subject to upper storey stepbacks.

Unique condition where the right of way includes grand parade and is +70m in width.

d. In areas of contiguous heritage resources, streetwall height should be consistent with heritage buildings.

The new building is consistent with heritage resources of past, and reflects the current varried street wall heights along all of Barrington.

The S-1 Design Manual also makes direct reference to the Development Site in section 3.4.1 Prominent Civic Frontages:

These frontages identify highly visible building sites that front onto important public open spaces such as the Citadel and Cornwallis Park, as well as important symbolic or ceremonial visual and physical connections such as the waterfront boardwalks, the proposed Grand Promenade linking the waterfront to the Town Clock, and other east-west streets that connect the downtown to the waterfront.



Figure 2.1.b Streetwall Height: Site context plan showing distance between building faces V.S. the height of the Barrington streetwall. Using the actual distance to the next building face, the ratio is approximately 1:3 streetwall height to street width.



Figure 2.1.c Streetwall Height: Diagram indicating double height fenestration "upper-level archways" and streetwall height.

ii. Transitional Block

The corner site transitions between 3-storey historic buildings towards the taller financial institutions north of the site notably the adjacent TD building on the corner of Barrington and George St. The progressive increase of streetwall heights creates a natural transition between the two, which is also identified as a guiding principle in the Design Manual.



Figure 2.1.d Streetwall Height: Barrington Street elevation showing heights of adjacent streetwalls.

iii. Build Heritage & Urban Character

Facing the site on Barrington St., Grand Parade provides a significant amount of open space and was the previous site for a landmark taller building; the Cragg building was built after the 1912 fire that destroyed the previous structures. For most of the 20th century, this prominent 7-storey building helped define the character of this corner, the public space of Grand Parade and the view corridor from the Town Clock to the Waterfront.

The Cragg Building was also instrumental in bridging Historic Halifax with the Modern era, as it was the tallest building in the Maritimes when built. Once a prominent urban site, the building was demolished in 1989 and the site remains a void to this day.

As a significant piece of the city's urban history, we believe that the corner supports a taller streetwall as part of this character and fits within the context of the site past and present. The proposed 7-storey corner streetwall reflects a historic built character and re-establishes its urban prominence, while further reinforcing the objectives of the current planning principles outlined below. The design manual section 3.2.1(d) mentions streewall height should be consistent with heritage buildings but does not define that those buildings need to still be physically present on the site.

We are also requesting a reduction in street-wall height along Barrington street to better connect to the adjacent Crowe block heritage facades and allow for the transition between the Crowe block and the height of the TD street-wall.



Figure 2.1.e Streetwall Height: Perspective diagram of Heritage built form context.

2.2 Variance Two : Streetwall Width

Design Rationale

The gaps in the streetwall provide an opportunity to accentuate the heritage facades by allowing them to turn the corner and maintain the character defining design features of the historic buildings. This gives visual prominence to the heritage resources as per S-1 Design Manual section 4.4.1

Our opinion is that this is better than the traditional 2-dimensional 'facadism' often seen in heritage preservation efforts, and sets a precedence in Halifax for preserving character defining design features that are unique to the historic buildings by maintaining a 3-dimensional portion of the architectural details, such as lintels and masonry corners.

Our section of street-wall width along Barrington is used to signify a covered retail entrance that may be converted into a primary entrance to the building in the future. This recess also gives a consistent language to the new architecture of the site which is critical in clearly defining what is heritage and what is new.



Relevant literature is as follows:

Downtown Halifax Land-Use Bylaw Section

9(5) A streetwall shall extend the full width of a lot abutting the streetline.

9(8) for variance through S.P.A.

Schedule S-1 Design Manual

3.6.4 Streetwall Width Variance:

Streetwall widths may be varied by Site Plan

Approval where:

a. The streetwall width is consistent with the objectives and guidelines of the Design Manual; and

b. The resulting gap in the streetwall has a clear purpose, is well-designed and makes a positive contribution to the streetscape.









20

2.3 Variance Three: Building Height

Design Rationale

As an adaptive re-use of a heritage building, the higher floor to floor heights are a function of the existing floors and fenestration of the Dennis building. By working with the existing conditions and creating taller floors, this provides the opportunity for an adaptive re-use of the historic building.

The height increase does not result in any additional floor area when compared to a building that would have typical floor to floor heights without the constraints of the heritage building. The height increase is only as a result of working with the heritage building and existing conditions. Should this additional height varience be removed it would require alteration to substantial fenestration within the existing heritage buildings and would alter the existing heritage structures substantially.



Figure 2.3.a Building Height: View at Barrington Street corner

Relevant literature is as follows:

Downtown Halifax Land-Use Bylaw Section

8(7) Map 5 Post Bonus Height of 28m

Schedule S-1 Design Manual

3.6.8 (e) Maximum Height Variance:

Maximum building height may be subject to modest variance by Site Plan Approval where:

a. The maximum height is consistent with the objectives and guidelines of the Design Manual; and

b. The additional building height is for roof top architectural features and the additional height does not result in an increase in gross floor area;

c. The maximum building height is less than 1.5 meters below the View Plane or Rampart height requirements;

e. Where the additional height is shown to enable the adaptive re-use of heritage buildings.



Figure 2.3.b Building Height: Floor heights of heritage building are maintained



23

2.4 Variance Four: Land-use at Grade floor-to-floor height

Design Rationale

The floor to floor heights are a function of preserving the Dennis Building which establishes the floor heights. A portion of the corner retail will exceed this floor to floor height as a corner feature to the building. The remaining retail along barrington and the floor to floor for residential use along Granville will vary from 3.6m to 4.2m.



Figure 2.4.a Land-use at Grade: Rendering at George Street and Granville Street

Relevant literature is as follows:

Downtown Halifax Land-Use Bylaw Section

8(13) f.t.f. of 4.5m, and 8(13B) for variance

Schedule S-1 Design Manual

3.6.15 Land Uses at Grade:

The minimum floor-to-floor height for the ground floor of a building having access at the streetline or Transportation Reserve may be varied by Site Plan Approval where:

a. The proposed floor-to-floor height of the ground floor is consistent with the objectives and guidelines of the Design Manual; and,

b. The proposed floor-to-floor height of the ground floor does not result in a sunken ground floor condition;

And at least one of the following:

c. In the case of the pr proposed addition to an existing building, the proposed height of the ground floor of the addition matches or is greater than the floor-to-floor height of the ground floor of the existing building.



public



03 Appendix

Appendix A: Pre-pre-application HRM comments